



This chapter appears in the book, *Business Systems Analysis with Ontologies*,  
edited by Peter Green and Michael Rosemann. © 2005, Idea Group Inc.

## Chapter II

# Evaluating Conceptual Modelling Practices: Composites, Things, Properties

Graeme Shanks, Monash University, Australia

Jasmina Nuredini, Monash University, Australia

Ron Weber, Monash University, Australia

## Abstract

---

*This chapter examines how ontological theory can be used to predict how alternative conceptual modelling representations affect end-user understanding of these representations. Specifically, it examines how ontological theory can be used to show how part-whole relations (composites) and things and properties can be best represented to enhance understanding of these real-world phenomena. We report the outcomes of two experiments that provide evidence to support the ontologically sound representation of part-whole relations and things and properties. We also discuss the outcomes of a cognitive process tracing study that explains why the ontologically sound representation of things and properties is more easily*

*understood. In essence, our empirical research provides evidence to support the use of ontology as a theoretical basis to guide conceptual modelling practices.*

## **Introduction**

---

The representation of real-world phenomena as conceptual models has been a concern of information systems practitioners and researchers for some time. For example, Wand, Storey, and Weber (1999) have sought to build a rigorous ontological theory to provide a model of the structure and dynamics of some facets of the real world in general. Their goal has been to provide a theoretical basis for evaluating conceptual modelling practices. Their theory is an adaptation and extension of an ontological theory proposed by Bunge (1977). Bunge's theory was selected because of its rigour and comprehensiveness. It provides thorough articulation of constructs such as things (entities), properties of things, states of things, and compositions of things — phenomena that are of major interest to conceptual modelling practitioners.

In this chapter, we focus on two features of the real world that conceptual modellers encounter — namely, the existence of things that are part of another thing and the distinction between things and properties. The notions that one thing may be part of another thing (e.g., a wheel is part of a bicycle) and the distinction between things and properties (e.g., a person is a thing with properties such as height and weight) are fundamental to the way people perceive and understand the world. In the context of conceptual modelling, these notions are problematic because alternative representations have been proposed and substantive theoretical issues remain unresolved. To illustrate, Rumbaugh, Jacobson, and Booch (1999, p. 146) state: “The aggregation (part-whole) relationship is transitive and antisymmetric across all aggregation links, even across those from different aggregation associations”, yet Winston, Chaffin, and Herrman (1987, pp. 431-432) argue that not all part-whole relations are transitive. Furthermore, composite things are sometimes represented explicitly as entities (e.g., Kilov & Ross, 1994, pp. 96-97) and sometimes implicitly as relationships between the components of the composite (e.g., Chen, 1976, p. 31). In terms of distinguishing between things and properties, proponents of the object-role approach to conceptual modelling claim the distinction is unimportant (Halpin, 1995). They model things and properties of things using the object symbol in a conceptual schema. In the entity-relationship model (Chen, 1976), however, things are represented as entity types, and properties are represented as attribute types. In our view, conceptual models should be used to discover and document stakeholder perceptions of a domain to provide a basis for informed discernment

26 more pages are available in the full version of this document, which may be purchased using the "Add to Cart" button on the publisher's webpage: [www.igi-global.com/chapter/evaluating-conceptual-modeling-practices/6118](http://www.igi-global.com/chapter/evaluating-conceptual-modeling-practices/6118)

## Related Content

---

### The Implementation of Large-Scale Decision-Making Support Systems: Problems, Findings, and Challenges

Manual Mora, Ovsei Gelman, Guisseppi Forgionne and Francisco Cervantes (2010). *Business Information Systems: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools and Applications* (pp. 1071-1083).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/implementation-large-scale-decision-making/44123](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/implementation-large-scale-decision-making/44123)

### ICT and Web 2.0 Technologies as a Determinant of Business Performance

Tanja Arh, Vlado Dimovski and Borka Jerman Blažic (2013). *Cases on Performance Measurement and Productivity Improvement: Technology Integration and Maturity* (pp. 80-105).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/ict-web-technologies-determinant-business/69108](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/ict-web-technologies-determinant-business/69108)

### Tripartition of Knowledge in Knowledge-Intensive Services

Tytti Kurtti, Samppa Määttä, Jukka Aaltonen, Annamari Turunen and Sari Riipi (2013). *Business Innovation, Development, and Advancement in the Digital Economy* (pp. 117-125).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/tripartition-knowledge-knowledge-intensive-services/74140](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/tripartition-knowledge-knowledge-intensive-services/74140)

### Building the Business Case

Len Asprey and Michael Middleton (2003). *Integrative Document and Content Management: Strategies for Exploiting Enterprise Knowledge* (pp. 240-267).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/building-business-case/24078](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/building-business-case/24078)

### Managing Corporate Information Systems Evolution and Maintenance

Ned Chapin (2005). *Managing Corporate Information Systems Evolution and Maintenance* (pp. 1-23).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/managing-corporate-information-systems-evolution/25742](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/managing-corporate-information-systems-evolution/25742)